

CAYANGAO, Victor L.

Re: Appeal; Disapproved Appointment;

Municipal Agricultural Officer

X-----X

RESOLUTION No. 040163

Mayor Grace P. Dagadag, Municipal Government of Tanudan, Kalinga, appeals the Order dated March 7, 2003 of the Civil Service Commission – Cordillera Administrative Region (CSC-CAR), Baguio City, which disapproved the appointment under permanent status of Victor L. Cayangao as Municipal Agricultural Officer of that municipality, for failure to meet the minimum experience and training requirements prescribed for the said position.

The pertinent portions of the assailed Order read, as follows:

“4. x x x.

“His experiences are focused more on being a teacher, hence the same are not relevant to

the MAO position.

“Further, Mr. Cayangao’s Performance Rating Sheets for Teachers for the rating periods SY 2000-2001, 2001-2002 show no functional relationship with the duties and responsibilities of a Municipal Agricultural Officer (MAO) as indicated in his Position Description Form. Therefore, his experience as Teacher cannot be considered relevant to the (MAO) position he is appointed to.

X X X

“5. As regards the certification of the PSB Chairman, it is to be mentioned that the Vice Mayor acts as Chairman of the PSB when the vacancy exists in his office or the office of the Sangguniang Bayan, unless he had been designated to act as Chairman in this instance. xxx

“6. There is no document that would show that he requested permission to transfer from DepEd, to LGU Tanudan.

“In view of the foregoing, the appointment of Mr. Victor L. Cayangao as Municipal Agricultural Officer, SG 20, Step I for the Municipal Government of Tanudan, Kalinga is hereby DISAPPROVED.”

In her appeal, Mayor Dagadag manifested that Cayangao had been in agricultural activities; that as a classroom teacher from 1981 to present, or a period of more than twenty (20) years, he had been teaching Home Economics and Livelihood Education, which is now a component of the Makabayang Edukasyon Pangkabuhayan at Pangkalusugan; that as a Non-Formal Education (NFE) Adult Literacy volunteer teacher from 1998 to 2000, he had taught his students agricultural livelihood programs; that as a component of the three (3) days Seminar Workshop of Non-Formal Education he had attended, he acquired more than eight (8) hours experience in educating students on agricultural livelihood programs; and that, he had likewise attended several seminars, training and workshops on agricultural production. However, Cayangao failed to present documentary evidence considering that they were allegedly misplaced or lost since he never thought that he could use them in the future.

Mayor Dagadag further avers that Cayangao's educational achievement is more than enough to compensate his deficiency in experience and training requirements for the subject position; that she was on official business when the Vice Mayor acted as Chairperson of the Personnel Selection Board (PSB) but the latter failed to indicate the reason when he issued the questioned certification of the PSB; and that Cayangao has submitted his request for permission to transfer from DepEd to the Municipal Government of Tanudan.

The CSC-CAR commented on the appeal, as follows:

"Cayangao's permit to transfer from the Department of Education to the LGU Tanudan, Kalinga was not attached. Cayangao has written that he would present his permit to transfer and his clearance if his proposal (Motion for Reconsideration) is acted upon favorably. Thus, Cayangao may be considered to have not been cleared and permitted to transfer from the Department of Education to the LGU Tanudan, Kalinga.

"Cayangao does not meet the requirement of relevant experience and training. Experience to be considered relevant must be gained either from government or private sector employment. The motion for reconsideration is bereft of any documentary evidence to prove such employment. What was submitted were self-serving statements and certifications. The position in question is a second level position where the qualifications standards must be met.

"On the assertion that the appointee's educational achievement more than compensates for his deficiency in relevant experience and training, CSC MC No. 42, series of 1991 no longer allows substitution for education and experience requirements effective January 1, 1993.

X X X

"WHEREFORE, it is prayed that the instant appeal/motion for reconsideration be denied. There is no reversible error committed by the CSC-CAR in its March 7, 2003 Order disapproving the appointment of Victor L. Cayangao as Municipal Agricultural Officer, LGU Tanudan, Kalinga."

Records show that on February 3, 2003, Victor L. Cayangao, a former Teacher of Gaang Elementary School, Tanudan, Kalinga, was appointed as Municipal Agricultural Officer (MAO) under permanent status by Mayor Grace P. Dagadag of the Municipal Government of Tanudan, Kalinga. In an Order dated March 7, 2003, the appointment of Cayangao was disapproved by the CSC-CAR for failure to meet the minimum experience and training requirements prescribed for the subject position. On March 28, 2003, Mayor Dagadag filed a motion for reconsideration which was received by the CSC-CAR on April 3, 2003. Pursuant to Civil Service Commission Memorandum Circular (CSC MC No. 15, s. 2002 (re: Policies on Facilitative Actions on Appointment and Motions for Reconsideration/Appeals), said motion was forwarded to the Commission Proper as an appeal from the decision of the CSC-CAR. Hence, this appeal.

The issue to be resolved is whether the disapproval of the appointment of Victor L. Cayangao as Municipal Agricultural Officer in the Municipal Government of Tanudan, Kalinga, is in accordance with the Civil Service Law and rules.

The revised 1997 Qualification Standards Manual provides the following qualifications for the position of Municipal Agricultural Officer, as follows:

Education	:	Bachelor's degree relevant to the job
Experience	:	Two (2) years of relevant experience
Training	:	Eight (8) hours of relevant training
Eligibility	:	Career Service (Professional) Second Level Eligibility

The qualifications of Cayangao, as shown in his Personal Data Sheet (PDS) accomplished on January 28, 2003, are as follows:

Education	:	Bachelor of Science in Agricultural Education (BSAE); Master of Arts in Education (MAEd)
Experience	:	Elementary Grade Teacher (Provisional Substitute) (DECS, August 10, 1981 – October 8, 1981) Elementary Grade Teacher (Substitute) (DECS, January 11, 1982 – March 11, 1982) Elementary Grade Teacher (Substitute) (DECS, July 2, 1984 – August 30, 1984)

Elementary Grade Teacher (Teacher I)
(DECS, August 12, 1985 – February 14, 2000)

Elementary Grade Teacher (Teacher II)
(DepEd, February 15, 2000 to present)

OTHERS: As Elementary Teacher; he served as volunteer in the NFE Adult Literacy (1998-1999) and later on designated as Coordinator (1999-2000), tasked in educating adult students particularly on agricultural livelihood programs or projects per certifications dated January 10, 2003 and March 25, 2003, respectively, issued by Santiago S. Wacas, Coordinating Principal, DepEd, Tanudan District, Division of Kalinga and Bernardo B. Pinangga, Barangay Chairman of Gaang, Tanudan, Kalinga.

Training : Pre-Entry Training Seminar (August 12-18, 1985)

Basic Training Course Phase I & II (October 23-26, 1986)
(Scouting Fundamental Course)

PRODED-ERP Teacher Formation Program
(March 2-12, 1987)

Upgrading Teachers Competencies (September 5-9, 1988)

Orientation Seminar for School Paper Adviser
(July 12-14, 1987)

Basic Education Curriculum (May 14-17, 2002)

NFE Seminar Workshop (December 17-19, 2000)

Eligibility : Professional Board Examination for Teachers (PBET)

On the basis of the foregoing information, there is no dispute that Cayangao substantially meets the educational and eligibility requirements for the position. Likewise, the eight hours training required for the position has been satisfied by Cayangao, in view of his attendance in a three-day seminar workshop on Nonformal Education held on December 17-19, 2000 at Davidson Hotel, Bulanao, Tabuk, Kalinga, where a part of that Seminar deals primarily on agricultural livelihood program as shown by Certificate of Participation issued by

Candida B. Tuguinay, NFE Education Supervisor, Division of Kalinga.

Moreover, while it may be true that Cayangao's experience concerns primarily with the duties and responsibilities of a teacher, records show that as classroom teacher for more than twenty (20) years, he had been teaching Home Economics and Livelihood Education which is now the component of the Makabayang Edukasyon Pangkabuhayan at Pangkalusugan. Said livelihood program includes imparting knowledge on basic livelihood such as gardening, crop and animal raising. Thus, a seemingly relevant experience prescribed for the MAO position. Similarly, Cayangao had served as volunteer in the NFE Adult Literacy (1998-1999) and later on designated as Coordinator (1999-2000), tasked in education students particularly on agricultural livelihood programs or projects per certifications dated January 10, 2003 and March 25, 2003, respectively, issued by Santiago S. Wacas, Coordinating Principal, DepEd, Tanudan District, Division of Kalinga, and Bernardo B. Pinangga, Barangay Chairman of Gaang, Tanudan, Kalinga. The certification issued to Cayangao that he had served for at least two years as NFE Adult Literacy volunteer teacher, tasked in educating adult students in agricultural livelihood programs, are more than enough to vouch for his claim of experience required for the MAO position.

Finally, **Section 1, Part III, CSC Memorandum Circular No. 12, s. 2003, re: Revised Policies on Qualification Standards** states that "relevant experience refers to previous employment or jobs or volunteer work on a full time basis in either the government or private sector, whose duties, as certified by the Human Resource Management Officer or authorized officials of the previous employer, are functionally related to the duties in the Position Description Form of the position to be filled." (Underscoring supplied). Verily, work experience denotes not only relevant experience in terms of employment that is being considered in the assessment of a job applicant's qualifications, but also other factors such as volunteer work in the public or private sector.

WHEREFORE, the appeal of Mayor Grace P. Dagadag is hereby **GRANTED**. Accordingly, the Order dated March 7, 2003 of the CSC-CAR, disapproving the appointment of Victor L. Cayangao as Municipal Agricultural Officer of Tanudan, Kalinga is hereby **REVERSED** and **SET ASIDE**.

Quezon City, February 19, 2004

(SGD.)

KARINA CONSTANTINO-DAVID

Chairman

(SGD.)

J. WALDEMAR V. VALMORES

Commissioner

(VACANT)
Commissioner

Attested by:

(SGD.)
REBECCA A. FERNANDEZ
Director IV
Commission Secretariat and Liaison Office